

# Let's Talk Dusty!

The Ultimate Forum for Dusty Springfield Fans

Skip to content

Search...	Search
Advanced search	

## Who knew?

Post a reply

Search this topic...	Search
----------------------	--------

31 posts • Page **1** of **1**

### Who knew? (#p156308)

by **daydreamer** » Wed Jul 09, 2014 8:02 am

I'm almost sure I didn't, (not until I just read one of the articles Darren posted on his articles thread), but there was another English language version of Io Che Non Vivo Senza Te....and apparently it was recorded in 1965, so before Dusty's YDHTSYLM 🤔 It was called 'Someone New' by Carlo Dini. Sometimes I read things and forget and sometimes I just never knew. I think here, it's the latter.

Top

### Re: Who knew? (#p156311)

by **countrycake** » Wed Jul 09, 2014 9:52 am

Despite my vintage, this is all news to me, Carole.

Your posting prompted me to dig around. Dini's version was released in the UK in April 1965 on HMV POP 1419. I haven't been able to find a copy of the record label to see who provided the English

lyric.

There is a fair amount of info on the net about Dini including this article:

<http://wikibin.org/articles/carlo-dini.html> (<http://wikibin.org/articles/carlo-dini.html>)

Irritatingly, the piece gives no info about the lyricist.

The details of his perfume business are accurate as I found this:

[http://www.universalperfumesandcosmetics.com/index.php?route=product/manufacturer/product&manufacturer\\_id=202](http://www.universalperfumesandcosmetics.com/index.php?route=product/manufacturer/product&manufacturer_id=202) ([http://www.universalperfumesandcosmetics.com/index.php?route=product/manufacturer/product&manufacturer\\_id=202](http://www.universalperfumesandcosmetics.com/index.php?route=product/manufacturer/product&manufacturer_id=202))

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p156331)**

by **darren2722** » Wed Jul 09, 2014 2:07 pm

WOW! Thanks, That sounds really great Carole 😊 but if Dusty did hear it, it's no wonder that she wanted to change the lyrics. 😊 Thanks for the info Jim. 👍

I do read *some* of the clippings before I post them but this one must have passed me by. 😊😊😊

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p156340)**

by **Corinna** » Wed Jul 09, 2014 3:22 pm

It was definitely new to me! Interesting to hear, and it also illustrates how difficult the key change from verse to chorus is! Dusty makes it sound so effortless... 🧐❤️

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p156345)**

by **daydreamer** » Wed Jul 09, 2014 4:38 pm

Yes Jim, I did some searching around as well. He appeared on BBC and ITV shows back in the early 60's and I can't help wondering if Dusty was aware of this recording. She talked so often of how she sat on it for a year hoping that no one would record it before her. As everyone sort of knew everyone else in the music business in London back then, it seems odd that she wouldn't have known of this. Maybe she did and decided not to draw attention to it 😊

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p156989)**

by **humboldt** » Sun Jul 20, 2014 7:15 pm

I sent this email to the foremost authority on Dusty about the original English language version of 'You Don't Have To Say You Love Me' called 'Someone New'.

**My memory is not so good these days. I think that I first found this about 4 years ago. I was making lists of all the foreign language versions of UK songs that I could find. As it was an English version I didn't pay it much heed! A few days ago I was searching for the Italian version of 'You Made Me So**

Very Happy' when his popped up in my searches! It was only then that I realised what I was listening too and that I should have paid more attention to the timeline before!

I have just ordered the single. It was a demo on HMV. CARLO DINI SOMEONE NEW/HERE IN MY HEART Original (Demo Copy) Black Vinyl HMV POP 1419 1965. The label should have the writers names!

Do you think D & V & S knew more about this than they've admitted, which is nothing. After all it was on TV! Also with your great knowledge I'm surprised that you'd never mentioned it or did it pass you by too?

This was the reply that I received.

Re: Someone New. I've been aware of this adaptation for some time as I found it listed on the database of registered works held by PRS. I'm sure at the time Wickham and Napier-Bell would have been made aware by Feldman's as they would have needed the publisher's permission for their own adaptation. It's reasonable to assume that Dusty also knew. Without checking, I can't remember the name of the English lyric writer but it's a German-sounding name which might explain why the lyrics aren't very good. What was Wickham and Napier-Bell's excuse?

So this appears to have been a very well kept secret, almost a cover up! I think that it's time that we all knew the truth about who wrote & recorded the original English version of 'YDHTSYLM'.

I have also emailed Vicki but I don't expect a reply!

Hi Vicki, I hope that this reaches you.

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=tnqi1hbjr4g> (<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=tnqi1hbjr4g>)

I have just ordered the single. It was a demo on HMV. CARLO DINI SOMEONE NEW/HERE IN MY HEART Original (Demo Copy) Black Vinyl HMV POP 1419 1965. The label should have the writers names!

Did you, Simon & Dusty know about this original English version as it has never been acknowledged? I also found it listed on the database of registered works held by PRS. I'm sure at the time you would have been made aware by Feldman's as you would have needed the publisher's permission for your own adaptation! Why was this version never mentioned?

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p156999)**

by **viper** » Mon Jul 21, 2014 9:23 am

This isn't as big a mystery as some are making out. 😊

*""Io che non vivo (senza te)" - "I, who can't live (without you)" - was introduced at the 1965 Sanremo Festival by Pino Donaggio - who'd co-written the song with Vito Pallavicini - and his team partner Jody Miller: the song took seventh place at Sanremo and as recorded by Donaggio reached #1 in Italy in March 1965. "Io che non vivo (senza te)" would also be prominently featured on the soundtrack of the Luchino Visconti film Vaghe stelle dell'Orsa (aka Sandra) starring Claudia Cardinale which was awarded the Golden Lion at the Venice Film Festival that September.*

*Dusty Springfield, who participated at the 1965 Sanremo Festival, was in the audience when*

**Donaggio and Miller performed "Io che non vivo (senza te)" and despite having no awareness of the lyrics' meaning the song moved Springfield to tears.[citation needed] Springfield obtained an acetate recording of Donaggio's song, but allowed a year to go by before actively pursuing the idea of recording an English version.**

On 9 March 1966, Springfield had an instrumental track of Donaggio's composition recorded at Philips Studio Marble Arch: the session personnel included guitarist Big Jim Sullivan and drummer Bobby Graham. Springfield still lacked an English lyric to record: eventually Springfield's friend Vicki Wickham, the producer of Ready Steady Go!, would write the required English lyric with her own friend Simon Napier-Bell who was the manager of the Yardbirds. Neither Wickham nor Napier-Bell had any discernible experience as songwriters: according to Napier-Bell, he and Wickham were dining out when she mentioned to him that Springfield hoped to get an English lyric for Donaggio's song and the two light heartedly took up the challenge of writing the lyric themselves: "We went back to [Wickham]'s flat and started working on it. We wanted to go to a trendy disco so we had about an hour to write it. We wrote the chorus and then we wrote the verse in a taxi to wherever we were going." [citation needed] Neither Wickham or Napier-Bell had any understanding of the Italian lyrics of the original song: according to Wickham they attempted to write their own lyric for an anti-love song to be called "I Don't Love You"; when that original idea proved unproductive it was adjusted first to "You Don't Love Me" and then "You Don't Have to Love Me" which was finalized as "You Don't Have to Say You Love Me" to fit the song's melody. Napier-Bell was later to title his first book (an autobiographical account of the British music scene of the 1960s) *You Don't Have to Say You Love Me* after the song.

Springfield recorded her vocal the next day: unhappy with the acoustics in the recording booth she eventually moved into a stairwell to record. Springfield was not satisfied with her vocal until she had recorded forty-seven takes.[citation needed]

Released on 25 March 1966 in the U.K., the single release of Springfield's recording became a huge hit and remains one of the songs most identified with her."

[http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/You\\_Don%27 ... ou\\_Love\\_Me](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/You_Don%27...ou_Love_Me) ([http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/You\\_Don%27t\\_Have\\_to\\_Say\\_You\\_Love\\_Me](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/You_Don%27t_Have_to_Say_You_Love_Me))

"CARLO DINI is an operatic Tenor, he was trained in Milano by professore Daniel Gabrieli he moved to London where he studied at the Royal College of Music, but preferred to be preferred to be tuitioned privately by HAROLD MILLER a reknown teacher in London that taught singers such as Shirley bassey, Julie Andrews and many more.... HAROLD MILLER obtained Carlo Dini's first television appearance on the Hughie Green quiz show (ITV television 1961), in which he was invited to sing. The public reaction was so overwhelming that Hughie Green invited him back the following week to sing with the show's Hostess Julie De Marco. This duet resulted in a series of appearances throughout the country. Shortly after Dini started to give concerts in his own right, delighting the English audience everywhere. It was during one of his apearances when Michael Black

a reknown manager saw him and signed him to an exclusive contract ( 1963). Michael Black was responsible for including Dini on several television shows on BBC and ITV, such as The Kathy Kirby show (1963) where he sang "CHE GELIDA MANINA" from LA BOHEME, he returned to sing the famous Neapolitan song "O SOLE MIO" and on his next television show "THE DONALD PEERS SHOW" (1964) he

sang

"E LUCE VA LE STELLE" from TOSCA,he also sang on Open House,(at Tyne Tees Television), EMI signed him to a contract( 1964),where he recorded several songs "HERE IN MY HEART" CARA MIA" (as featured on Youtube)[b]amongst his recordings DON CHARLES producer at EMI offered him a song from Italy entitled "IO CHE NON VIVO" which was specially translated to "SOMEONE NEW"(as featured on Youtube)The song was aired all over the radios,and a year later Dusti Springfield had another version penned entitled "You don't have to say you love me"[/b].Dini being an operatic singer consequently sang the song with a completely different approach (which can be heard on Youtube)As an investment Carlo Dini started a perfume company and called the perume "PURDEY" after the character Joanna Lumley was playing in the series.The perfume was advertised in all the magazines such as Vogue,Hapers Bizarre....."

<http://wikibin.org/articles/carlo-dini.html> (<http://wikibin.org/articles/carlo-dini.html>)

..... 

Note the 'i' instead of 'y'. In some languages 'i' and 'y' are interchangeable as they are considered the same thing.

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157002)**

by **humboldt** » Mon Jul 21, 2014 10:38 am

My final post on this unless I hear from Vicki. Yes, I know all that thanks, found it out as part of my investigation. What I'm saying is that for nearly 50 years Dusty's fans have been lead to believe that V & S wrote the original English lyrics to 'Io che non vivo (senza te)' but that's not true! Never has it been documented or acknowledged that an earlier version existed. Book upon book has been written without this fact being mentioned. In my mind that's deceit.



[./download](#)

[/file.php?id=21304&mode=view\)](#)

The extra name on the label taking a writers credit is J. BUUCH about whom I can find absolutely nothing!

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157003)**

by **countrycake** » Mon Jul 21, 2014 12:39 pm

Thanks, John, for tracking down copy label of the Carlo Dini disc and identifying the writer of the original English lyrics. I tried to do the same about 10 days ago, but failed where you have succeeded. The hunt is now on for J. Buuch, assuming that there are no errors in the label credit.

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157004)**

by **viper** » Mon Jul 21, 2014 12:51 pm

***humboldt wrote:***

My final post on this unless I hear from Vicki. Yes, I know all that thanks, found it out as part of my investigation. What I'm saying is that for nearly 50 years Dusty's fans have been lead to believe that V & S wrote the original English lyrics to 'Io che non vivo (senza te)' but that's not true! Never has it been documented or acknowledged that an

earlier version existed. Book upon book has been written without this fact being mentioned. In my mind that's deceit.

IMG.jpg

The extra name on the label taking a writers credit is J. BUUCH about whom I can find absolutely nothing!

O.K. H, maybe I'm missing something, being a bit thick, or got something upside down. Would you do me a favour and correct me if I'm getting this wrong ?

It appears that:

1. "Io che non vivo (senza te)" - "I, who can't live (without you)" came first, in Italian.
2. This was translated/rewritten into English and recorded as 'Someone New' by Carlo Dini.
3. The music was used, and new lyrics written, then recorded by Dusty as 'You Don't Have To Say You Love Me'.
4. The lyrics of "Io che non vivo (senza te)" - "I, who can't live (without you)" are entirely different to 'You Don't Have To Say You Love Me' though the music/backing track/riddem is the same.
5. Doesn't that mean they are two different songs ? Example: Shaggy - 'It Wasn't Me', Lady Saw - 'Son Of A Bitch'

6. Or, are you saying that everyone has been led to believe, 'Io che non vivo (senza te)', and, 'You don't Have to Say you Love Me' were written by the same folks ?

7. I see/hear two different songs, written by different folks, recorded by different artists but using the same music/backing track/riddem, a classic Motown and others were known to practice. Am I missing something ?

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157019)**

by **humboldt** » Mon Jul 21, 2014 4:25 pm

One final time. What I'm saying is that for nearly 50 years Dusty's fans have been led to believe that V & S wrote the original English lyrics to 'Io che non vivo (senza te)' but that's not true! Never has it been documented or acknowledged that an earlier version existed. Book upon book has been written without this fact being mentioned. In my mind that's deceit.

So there is **one** original Italian composition but at least **two** English language versions of the same melody of which Dusty's **was the second not the first and only one** as we have been led to believe. I really can't make myself any clearer.

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157021)**

by **humboldt** » Mon Jul 21, 2014 4:28 pm

*countrycake wrote:*

Thanks, John, for tracking down copy label of the Carlo Dini disc and identifying the writer of the original English lyrics. I tried to do the same about 10 days ago, but failed where you have succeeded. The hunt is now on for J. Buuch, assuming that there are no

errors in the label credit.

Hi Jim. I actually bought the single in order to see who the writing credits were. 😊 As I said J. Buuch does not appear on any searches 😞

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157030)**

by **countrycake** » Mon Jul 21, 2014 7:14 pm

There is only one song. The two separate English-language versions of that song are simply that, ie versions of that original Italian song: they are not new or different songs, merely versions of an existing song.

That said, it is rather odd that the UK publisher sanctioned two separate English lyrics. it was probably a hard-nosed business decision, in that the first English version was not successful, so why not see if this second English version might be more successful. The fact that it was to be recorded by a star name might have had a big influence.

John, the reason I queried the accuracy of the label credit is that Buuch seems to be a very rare name. I could not find any entries for that surname, so I wondered whether the surname could have been Buch or Bruch, on the basis that the credits on the labels of 1960s singles were not always models of accuracy. The search continues.

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157046)**

by **donellac** » Mon Jul 21, 2014 11:04 pm

Now wait. Haud the bus!

Doesn't Carole say, in her original post, that she has just read one of Darren's cuttings which told her that there is another and earlier english language version of Io Che Non Vivo Senza Te.

I found it! It is in the Record Mirror 26th March 1966 - The Face.

Doesn't this mean that, though it may not have been broadcast from the rooftops, the existence of this other version was not kept a secret?

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157047)**

by **Sweetbaby** » Mon Jul 21, 2014 11:37 pm



Actually it's not unheard of for a song whose original lyrics were not in English to be rendered in English with more than one set of lyrics. Most of my board buds will be aware of the Kiki Dee hit *Amoureuse* whose French-language original was also the basis for the lyrically distinct US hit for Helen Reddy entitled *Emotion*.

Another example is the Creole song *Choucounne* best known in English as *Yellow Bird* but whose first charting English version was *Don't Ever Leave Me* by Harry Belafonte.

The example of this phenomenon which I'm most aware of is the Hawaiian song which has been rendered in English both as *Pearly Shells* & *First Night of the Full Moon*. I remember hearing *First Night...* by Jack Jones a few times on the radio when I was a preschooler & then never hearing it again: however I've since heard the same tune with the *Pearly Shells* lyrics - which I considered comparatively inferior - fairly often.

I realize that both *Choucounne* & the original of *Pearly Shells* were likely public domain numbers so there wouldn't be the possibility of copyright complications with distinct sets of lyrics. However *Amoureuse* certainly had publishers who could have taken umbrage at multi-translations if music publishers tended to be so inclined. The latter scenario would also have applied to the Portuguese-language *Manhã de Carnaval* which has been distinctly rendered in English three times: as *A Day in the Life of a Fool*, *Carnival*, & *Where Did It Go*.

And to consider English-language songs rendered in other languages: *I Don't Know How to Love Him* had two distinct contemporaneous Swedish renderings - each of them recorded by a future ABBA songstress (Agnetha recorded *Vart Ska Min Karlek Fora*, Frida: *Vad Gör Jag Med Min Kärlek*). In fact there's several other examples of YDHTSYLM itself having multiple "translations" within the same language - there's at least three in German.

It's certainly interesting that there was an earlier forgotten (if ever noticed) English-language version of *lo che non vivo (senza te)*. But it's not a unique scenario.

Last edited by [Sweetbaby](#) (./memberlist.php?mode=viewprofile&u=171) on Fri Aug 15, 2014 8:56 pm, edited 1 time in total.

Top

## **Re: Who knew? (#p157057)**

by **viper** » Tue Jul 22, 2014 9:25 am

I got pondering this some more yesterday afternoon. Then last night I saw Humboldt, and CountryCakes replies, which cut across the grain of my thoughts.

***humboldt wrote:***

So there is **one** original Italian composition but at least **two** English language versions of the same melody of which Dusty's **was the second not the first and only one** as we have been lead to believe. I really can't make myself any clearer.

***countrycake wrote:***

There is only one song. The two separate English-language versions of that song are simply that, ie versions of that original Italian song: they are not new or different songs, merely versions of an existing song.

I disagree.

In fact I disagreed so much last night I went off and spent three hours looking further into this, and planning the foundations of my reply.

This morning I find:

**donellac wrote:**

Now wait. Haud the bus!

Doesn't Carole say, in her original post, that she has just read one of Darren's cuttings which told her that there is another and earlier english language version of *Io Che Non Vivo Senza Te*.

I found it! It is in the Record Mirror 26th March 1966 - The Face.

Doesn't this mean that, though it may not have been broadcast from the rooftops, the existence of this other version was not kept a secret?

This is indeed a very good sound point. Not the one I was preparing to argue, but nevertheless, a very significant observation. This is followed up by some equally significant and valid observations by SweetBaby;

**Sweetbaby wrote:**

😊 Actually it's not unheard of for a song whose original lyrics were not in English to be rendered in English with more than one set of lyrics. Most of my board buds will be aware of the Kiki Dee hit *Amoureuse* whose French-language original was also the basis for the lyrically distinct US hit for Helen Reddy entitled *Emotion*.

Another example is the Creole song *Choucounè* best known in English as *Yellow Bird* but whose first charting English version was *Don't Ever Leave Me* by Harry Belafonte.

The example of this phenomenon which I'm most aware of is the Hawaiian song which has been rendered in English both as *Pearly Shells* & *First Night of the Full Moon*. I remember hearing *First Night...* by Jack Jones a few times on the radio when I was a preschooler & then never hearing it again: however I've since heard the same tune with the *Pearly Shells* lyrics - which I considered comparatively inferior - fairly often.

I realize that both *Choucounè* & the original of *Pearly Shells* were likely public domain numbers so there wouldn't be the possibility of copyright complications with distinct sets of lyrics. However *Amoureuse* certainly had publishers who could have taken umbrage at multi-translations if music publishers tended to be so inclined. The latter scenario would also have applied to the Portuguese-language *Manhã de Carnaval* which has been distinctly rendered in English three times: as *A Day in the Life of a Fool*, *Carnival*, & *Where Did It Go*.

And to consider English-language songs rendered in other languages: *I Don't Know How to*

*Love Him* had two distinct contemporaneous Swedish renderings - each of them recorded by a future ABBA songstress (Agnetha recorded *Vart Ska Min Karlek Fora* , Frida: *Vad Gör Jag Med Min Kärlek*). In fact there's several other examples of YDHTSYLM itself having multiple "translations" within the same language - there's at least three in German.

It's certainly interesting that there was an earlier forgotten (if ever noticed) English-language version of *lo che non vivo (senza te)*. But it's not a unique scenario.

Whilst I'm unfamiliar with the recordings SB speaks of, in the context of this argument some very valid points are still made. I intend to further some of these points leaving copyright issues aside.

As the old saying goes, 'go with what you know', and in the setting of my argument I intend to do just that. Be patient, this is going to take some time, and I also have a couple of things need tending today. I'd advise you to get a nice pot of tea/coffee/jug of cider ready, nibbles, and roll a couple of smokes ready for this one. 🍷

I'll get back to you later.

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157062)**

by **darren2722** » Tue Jul 22, 2014 11:59 am

First of all I'm not taking sides in this particular 'argument' but here's the original almost throwaway line as it appeared in The Record Mirror dated 26 March 1966.

And in retrospective a online blog (Scroll down right to the bottom) that acknowledges that Someone New got some decent airplay on Radio Caroline but as we know failed to make the Top Forty.\* Again another throwaway line. <http://www.google.co.uk/url?sa=t&rct=j&...8958,d.ZGU> (<http://www.google.co.uk/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=14&ved=0CDkQFjADOAo&url=http%3A%2F%2Fwww.radiolondon.co.uk%2Fr%2Fscrap60%2Ffabforty%2F65fabs%2Fapril65%2Ffab040465%2Ffab040465.html&ei=jE3OU8GACYuM7AbViICwAg&usg=AFQjCNHMfFVBhIoY1jozf3D39pjlkw44gw&sig2=XmpRXeXZ08HDUxBkvmVl0w&bvm=bv.71198958,d.ZGU>)

\* Edit Better just say that this Top 40 is the Early Radio London Fab Forties Chart, Not the Official or NME Chart 😞

Attachments

(./download/file.php?id=21325&mode=view)

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157070)**

by **Sweetbaby** » Tue Jul 22, 2014 5:59 pm



I somehow overlooked another example of a song with two distinct sets of English lyrics:

the Italian hit *Gloria* is of course well-known via the 1982 English language version by Laura Branigan but in 1979 Jonathan King had recorded his own lyrics for the song with his version charting at #65 UK: Umberto Tozzi, the composer/singer of the Italian original, also cut *Gloria* with King's lyrics.

Last edited by [Sweetbaby](#) ([./memberlist.php?mode=viewprofile&u=171](#)) on Fri Aug 15, 2014 8:55 pm, edited 1 time in total.

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157075)**

by [Corinna](#) » Tue Jul 22, 2014 7:17 pm

It never ceases to amaze me what the combined cleverness of this forum can unearth!

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157079)**

by [Rob](#) » Tue Jul 22, 2014 8:05 pm

Yes indeed Cor, and so much research.

R 😊 B

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157085)**

by [mnmcv1](#) » Tue Jul 22, 2014 8:14 pm

I understand John's point- this was not exactly a "secret", but it has NEVER been discussed in any Dusty book, and I don't recall Dusty, or Vicki or anyone else mentioning it in interviews.

Of course, we find out new things all the time that have slipped through the cracks. I'd never heard any mention of Dusty singing "I Found Love" at RAH- it's not mentioned ANYWHERE, EVER- not even in Paul's book...but lo and behold, she did.

SIDENOTE: In 1998 Arista head Clive Davis forced Ace of Base to change the lyrics to an already-released song called "Life is a Flower" (some of you may know it- it reached #5 in the UK) because he thought it was too "European" to be a hit in the US. The production changed up a bit, the newly christened song was "Whenever You're Near Me". Same "song", completely different lyrics.

It happens.

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157106)**

by [A Girl Called Christal](#) » Wed Jul 23, 2014 8:08 am

I'm bookmarking this thread and will be following up with research for my Dusty book.

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157132)**

by [paula](#) » Wed Jul 23, 2014 1:43 pm

So many songs, writers, artists, languages... It's a wonder there aren't more twists regarding who did what first 🤔

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157172)**

by **dig123** » Thu Jul 24, 2014 1:32 pm

PBS had a folk theme last night. Of course, The Springfields were mentioned, Norma Tanega and the song First Time Ever I Saw Your Face sung by a man. I never heard that version before. Wasn't that one of the songs Dusty refused?? Anyway, I had to do a search and it's been recorded about 4 times before Roberta Flack. Can't be track of who sung what!!

Di

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157174)**

by **daydreamer** » Thu Jul 24, 2014 2:42 pm

Markus, it IS actually mentioned in Paul's book but not singularly under live performances, you will find it under the RAH set list on page 418. I believe his criteria for the live performance listings was that the songs had to have been performed on TV, (this song was cut), radio or at least made it onto a CD release. She sang so many songs on stage, radio and TV that aren't mentioned in the book (for instance Man with The Child in his Eyes from Drury Lane), they couldn't all be documented.

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157186)**

by **Sweetbaby** » Thu Jul 24, 2014 8:57 pm



I don't think prior to Roberta's interpretation *First Time Ever...* would have been deemed likely material for a mainstream pop singer, it being considered a modern folk song & being recorded exclusively by artists with folk associations including the Springfields' US counterparts Peter Paul & Mary and also by Marianne Faithfull & Gordon Lightfoot among others. BTW - Roberta's version was actually recorded in 1969 but only came to the fore in 1972 after appearing on the soundtrack of the film **Play Misty For Me**.

Last edited by [Sweetbaby](#) ([./memberlist.php?mode=viewprofile&u=171](#)) on Fri Aug 15, 2014 8:55 pm, edited 1 time in total.

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157193)**

by **viper** » Fri Jul 25, 2014 1:38 pm

**Is "lo che non vivo (senza te)" - "I, who can't live (without you)" the first version of 'You Don't Have To Say You Love Me' ?**

Lets start at the beginning with 'lo Che Non Vivo (Senza Te)'.

'lo Che Non Vivo (Senza Te)' - 'I, who can't live (without you)' was introduced at the 1965 Sanremo Festival by its composer Pino Donaggio who had co-written the song with Vito Pallavicini and his team partner Jody Miller.

This is an undisputed original musical composition accompanied by original Italian lyrics;

### Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te)

Siamo Qui noi soli  
Come ogni sera  
Ma tu sei piu triste  
E io lo so perche

So che tu vuoi dirmi  
Che non sei felice  
Che io sto cambiando  
E tu mi vuoi laciare

Io che non vivo piu di un'ora senza te  
Come posso stare una vita senza te  
Sei mia, s ei mia, mai niente lo sai  
Separarci un giorno potrai

Vieni Qui ascoltami  
Che io ti voglio bene  
Te ne prego fermati  
Ancora insieme a me

Io che non vivo piu di un'ora senza te  
Come posso stare una vita senza te  
Sei mia, sei mia, s ei mia

Io che non vivo piu di un'ora senza te  
Come posso stare una vita senza te  
Sei mia, sei mia, sei mia.

Which Google language translator interprets into English as;

### 'I, Who Can't Live (Without You)'

We're Here we just  
Like every evening  
But you're more sad  
And I know why

I know you want to tell me  
That you're not happy  
I'm changing  
And you want me laciare

I can not live more than an hour without you  
How can I spend a life without you  
You're mine, s and mine, anything you know  
One day you will be able to separate us

Come listen here  
I wish you well  
I beg stopped  
Still with me

I can not live more than an hour without you  
How can I spend a life without you  
You are mine, you are mine, and my s

I can not live more than an hour without you  
How can I spend a life without you  
You're mine, you're mine, you're mine.

So far so good. One original musical composition with it's original lyrics.

It is accepted that this is the composition and song heard by Dusty Springfield at the 1965 Sanremo Festival. It is also accepted that, *“despite having no awareness of the lyrics' meaning the song moved Springfield to tears.”*, who then, *“obtained an acetate recording of Donaggio's song, but allowed a year to go by before actively pursuing the idea of recording an English version.”*

That this musical composition and its lyrics became the inspiration for what would become 'You Don't Have To Say You Love Me' is not in dispute. However, it has been asserted that:

*“... for nearly 50 years Dusty's fans have been lead to believe that V & S wrote the original English lyrics to 'lo che non vivo (senza te)' but that's not true! Never has it been documented or acknowledged that an earlier version existed. Book upon book has been written without this fact being mentioned. In my mind that's deceit.*

*So there is one original Italian composition but at least two English language versions of the same*

*melody of which Dusty's was the second not the first and only one as we have been lead to believe."*

Further, *"There is only one song. The two separate English-language versions of that song are simply that, ie versions of that original Italian song: they are not new or different songs, merely versions of an existing song."*

Are these assertions correct ?

It is now known that Carlo Dini, an operatic Tenor, who was trained in Milano by professor Daniel Gabrieli and moved to London where he studied at the Royal College of Music recorded a song titled 'Someone New', in English, in the interim between 'Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te) - I, Who Can't Live (Without You)' and 'You Don't Have To Say You Love Me'.

It is asserted that "Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te)" and 'Someone New' are different versions of the same song. This is incorrect.

Though it is stated, "Don Charles producer at EMI offered", Carlo Dini, "a song from Italy entitled 'Io Che Non Vivo' which was specially translated to 'Someone New'", this too is incorrect. The lyrics of 'Someone New' are entirely different from 'Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te)'.

### 'Someone New'

Heaven holds the stars that fall  
But it's still a long lost cause  
Did I hear you say goodbye,  
And sigh for someone new ?

Someone who will always know  
How the tide of love will flow  
Don't forget that you can learn  
To yearn for someone new

So lover, lover let me  
See that love light in your eyes  
I'm so sad and lonely  
Will you ever realise  
I love you,  
I love you  
You are part of my life  
I can not believe I lose your love

So I wish all joy adieu  
Something borrowed something blue  
Just a dream for ever long  
Your gone to someone new

Lover, lover let me  
See that love light in your eyes  
I'm so sad and lonely  
Will you ever realise

I love you, I love you  
Someone, yes that someone says  
You've fallen for his ways  
One day  
Some day maybe soon  
You'll come back and you'll say

I love you,  
I love you,  
I, love, you.

So, what we have are two different song lyrics, constituting two separate songs, recorded by different artistes with different musicians in different recording studio's with different recording producers. Though the musical composition on 'Someone New' may sound so similar as to be almost identical to 'Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te)' there are subtle differences.

These differences between the two compositions may indeed be slight, but they are there, technically rendering each recorded song as distinctively different. This does not negate that the musical composition accompanying 'Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te)' is the inspiration for the musical composition accompanying 'Someone New', and this is not in dispute.

-----

Before discussing further "Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te)", 'Someone New', and before even mentioning 'You Don't Have To Say You Love Me', lets look into the differing interpretations of 'version' as generally and commonly used to differentiate between old, different, and new musical recordings or performances.

The most common use of 'version' is applied to the 'cover version'. However this class of 'version' has

two distinct category's; the 'straight cover version' and the 'evolved cover version'. Lets look at the 'straight cover version' first.

### Straight Cover Version

The 'straight cover version' is simply another artiste/musician singing and playing an original musical and/or lyrical composition using the same musical composition structure and lyrics and playing/singing the composition, usually, to the best of their ability. Put simply, singing and playing somebody else's song.

Examples:

KC And The Sunshine Band - 'That's The Way I Like It' cover by Dead Or Alive,  
The Shirelles - 'Will You Still Love Me Tomorrow' cover by Dusty Springfield,  
Roxy Music - 'Love is The Drug' cover by Grace Jones,  
Gloria Jones - 'Tainted Love' cover by Soft Cell.  
Dusty Springfield - 'I Only Want To Be with You' cover by The Tourists  
Bo Diddly - 'Who Do You Love' cover by Jesus And Mary Chain  
The Velvettes - ' He Was Really Saying Something' cover by Bananarama  
The Pilgrim Travellers - 'Jesus Met The Woman At The Well' cover by Nick Cave

### Evolved Cover Version

The evolved cover version whilst essentially regarded as a 'straight cover version' differs from the 'straight cover version' in that there is some change made to the musical compositions structure, or more usually, the lyrical content is altered.

Examples:

The Crystals - 'When He Kissed Me' and The Ronettes - 'Be My Baby' cover by Rachel Sweet as 'Then He Kissed Me/Be My Baby'  
The Small Faces - 'Whatcha Gonna Do About It' cover by Sex Pistols  
Nancy Sinatra - 'These Boots Are Made For Walking' cover by The Meteors  
Sonny Curtis - 'I Faught The Law' cover by Dead Kennedys  
Jack Scott - 'The Way I Walk' cover by The Cramps  
Ronnie Dawson - 'Rockin' Bones' cover by The Cramps  
Bob Marley - 'Waiting In Vain' cover by Coca Tea  
Richard Kiley - 'The Impossible Dream' cover by Carter The Unstoppable Sex Machine  
Cole Porter - 'Well Did You Evah' cover by Debbie Harry & Iggy Pop

Having established definitions of the 'straight cover version' and the 'evolved cover version' lets now look at some other types of 'version'. Lets begin with;

### The Evolved Version

This is where an artiste changes or evolves the musical or lyrical composition (sometimes both) of their own original composition over a period of time. This may involve any released material that enters into the public domain through demo's or bootlegs as well as official releases and also includes recordings of live performances.

Examples;

Sex Pistols - 'Silly Thing'. There are two versions of this song officially released. One on the album 'The Great Rock 'N' Roll Swindle', the other being released as a single. The single version differs from the album version both in musical composition and lyrical content. This is also true of several other Sex Pistols songs particularly 'Anarchy In The U.K.', and, 'God Save The Queen'. The demo's and bootleg recordings of these songs reflect the development of both the lyrical content and musical structure of the compositions.

The Damned - 'Curtain Call'. The recorded studio version of this composition is over seventeen minutes long. However when the band choose to play this song live on stage they rarely perform the entire composition in one piece. It is more usually either performed as a roughly ten minute rendition, or split into two parts. The first part used to open a live set, and the second part to end the live set before encores are performed.

### **The Evolved Performance Version**

This is essentially the same as the 'evolved version' with the difference that it refers only to compositions performed live on stage, including 'straight' and 'evolved' cover versions.

Example;

The Cramps - 'Surfin Bird'. Whilst the recorded version, best known from the album 'Off The Bone', is considered to be a 'straight cover version' of The Trashmen's original, in live performance The Cramps evolved their rendition from an average five minute performance into performances over sixteen minutes long.

### **The Dub Version**

Generally speaking this was a genre specific phenomena developed amongst various Jamaican recording artistes, studio engineers, and producers. A leading exponent and well regarded pioneer of dub is recording artiste, record producer, and self appointed Professor Of Dub, Lee 'Scratch' Perry.

Dub versions are usually lacking in lyrical content, although sometimes a phrase, line, or just a word may be used as a feature of the dub version. More often the dub version concerns itself with enhancements to the composition of the backing track via the use of echo, reverb, rim shots, or other various enhancements to the sounds of instruments. Traditionally dub versions make a feature of drum and bass rhythms. Since their emergence and subsequent popularity the dub version has evolved into mainstream popular music sometimes in whole, but more often in part, as various dub techniques have been learned and used by many record producers outside of Jamaica.

In the 1980's the phenomena of the 'twelve inch version' emerged from the popularity of dub version experimentalism by a wide variety of musical artistes and record producers. One of the most notable examples of this are the various remixes of Frankie Goes To Hollywood's 'Two Tribes'.

The popularity of dub in Jamaican recording compositions gave rise to entire new genres within Reggae culture. The artiste U-Roy popularised a style of lyricism based in dub known as Toasting, out of which the Dancehall genre was born.

### **The Dancehall Version**

The Dancehall version is characterised by first establishing a 'riddim' or backing track composition over which a variety of recording artistes use the exact same riddim to record their own unique lyrical compositions. Whilst the riddim is exactly the same the differing lyrical content by different artistes are considered to be uniquely different songs rather than variations or versions.

Exappmle;

### The Parody Version

The parody version usually takes the format of a 'straight cover version' with changed lyrical content intent on comic effect. It is actually an 'evolved cover version'.

-----

Lets return to 'Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te) - I, Who Can't Live (Without You)' and 'Someone New'. 'Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te) - I, Who Can't Live (Without You)' opens with a dramatic trumpet solo and proceeds with choir like backing vocals where as 'Someone New' although opening with the same trumpet solo proceeds with a string section and dramatic drums without backing vocals.

Following the initial opening trumpet solo accompanied by backing vocals the 'Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te)' composition stops dead proceeding with the first line of the song before the musical accompaniment begins again. 'Someone New' follows in the same manner but differs in that the accompanying strings arrangement is punctuated by the use of trumpet and drum, which continues throughout the composition. No use of backing vocals are made.

As already stated the lyrics of 'Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te) - I, Who Can't Live (Without You)' are completely different from 'Someone New' and as noted the musical composition also varies. Is 'Someone New' a cover version of 'Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te) - I, Who Can't Live (Without You)' ?

No, it is not.

Is the musical composition of 'Someone New' a cover version of the musical composition of 'Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te) - I, Who Can't Live (Without You)' ?

As a musical composition it would appear to fall into the definition of 'the evolved cover version'. However, this is not so. Combined as it is with the brand new lyrics, which are not a variation of the original Italian lyrics, we must apply the 'My Way' Precedent. Even if we allow for recording techniques, methods, and standard practices of the time, that might give rise to consideration of the musical composition being viewed in terms of an early or vintage Dancehall version, which the subtle variation of it's performance negates, 'Someone New' must be considered a unique musical and lyrical composition.

Precedent for viewing it in this way comes from the way in which Frank Sinatra's 'My Way' is accepted as a genuine new and unique composition.

*“My Way’ is a song popularized by Frank Sinatra. Its lyrics were written by Paul Anka and set to music based on the French song ‘Comme d’habitude’ composed in 1967 by Claude Francois and Jacques Revaux. Anka’s English lyrics are unrelated to the original French song.”* Anka, *“subtly altering the melodic structure”*, of the musical composition.

Put into simple terms: 'Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te)' is an entirely different song to 'Someone New' and therefore equates two distinct and unique compositions.

Now, before examining 'You Don't Have To Say You Love Me', lets look at the Sid Vicious version of 'My Way'. Whilst generally regarded as a 'straight cover version' this is not so. It's unique musical arrangement combined with differing lyrical content define it as an 'evolved cover version' rather than a 'straight cover version', or a distinctly unique composition.

Though it is undeniable it's creation is dependent upon, *“the French song ‘Comme d’habitude’ composed in 1967 by Claude Francois and Jacques Revaux”*, this does not make it an 'evolved cover version' of *“the French song ‘Comme d’habitude’ composed in 1967 by Claude Francois and Jacques Revaux”*, but an 'evolved cover version' of 'My Way'.

Baring in mind that it is accepted that 'Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te)' was the composition and song heard by Dusty Springfield at the 1965 Sanremo Festival and that, *“despite having no awareness of the lyrics’ meaning the song moved Springfield to tears.”*, who then, *“obtained an acetate recording of Donaggio’s song, but allowed a year to go by before actively pursuing the idea of recording an English version.”*, can it be said that 'You Don't Have To Say You Love Me' is a 'straight cover version' or an 'evolved cover version' of 'Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te)' or 'Someone New' ?

Without doubt or dispute 'You Don't Have To Say You Love Me' could not have been created without 'Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te)'. The same may not be said to be true in the case of 'Someone New'. 'Someone New' could not have been created without 'Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te)', but 'You Don't Have To Say You Love Me' could have been created without 'Someone New'.

If Frank Sinatra's 'My Way' is accepted as a genuine new and unique composition does it not follow that 'You Don't Have To Say You Love Me', directly influenced by 'Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te)' is as much a unique composition as 'Someone New' ?

The opening introduction follows the 'Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te)' pattern opening with a trumpet

solo accompanied by backing vocals although subtly, the trumpet is more prominent and the backing vocals are less choir like or operatic and more harmonic. Musically, though it may be subtle, 'You Don't Have To Say You Love Me' is distinctively different from both 'Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te)' and 'Someone New'.

Employing the 'My Way' Precedent, with its distinctive and entirely unrelated different lyrics combined with its subtle rearrangement of musical composition and lead vocal gender change 'You Don't Have To Say You Love Me' must be viewed as a unique composition in its own right.

Therefore the assertions;

1. *“for nearly 50 years Dusty’s fans have been lead to believe that V & S wrote the original English lyrics to ‘Io che non vivo (senza te)’ but that’s not true!”*

This is correct in that it is not true that 'Io Che Non Vivo (Senza Te)' and 'You Don't Have To Say You Love Me' are the same composition.

2. *“Never has it been documented or acknowledged that an earlier version existed.”*

Why should it be? No earlier version of 'You Don't Have To Say You Love Me' or 'Someone New' do exist in English, Italian, German, French, Spanish, Russian, or Chinese. 'You Don't Have To Say You Love Me' and 'Someone New' are unique compositions in their own right.

3. *“Book upon book has been written without this fact being mentioned. In my mind that’s deceit.”*

'You Don't Have To Say You Love Me' is a unique composition, therefore there is no deceit.

4. *“So there is one original Italian composition but at least two English language versions of the same melody of which Dusty's was the second not the first and only one.”*

This is correct, though not wholly accurate. There is one Italian composition, and two unique English language compositions based upon inspiration taken from the Italian composition. Chronologically Dusty's composition is the second one. Neither 'Someone New' or 'You Don't Have To Say You Love Me' are versions of the Italian composition. They are distinctively unique compositions in their own right as defined by the 'My Way' Precedent.

5. *“There is only one song. The two separate English-language versions of that song are simply that, ie versions of that original Italian song: they are not new or different songs, merely versions of an existing song.”*

This is incorrect.

Viper 25/7/2014

First published 25/7/2014 by Viper The Undead - <http://www.psychocat.co.uk>  
(<http://www.psychocat.co.uk>)

All songs mentioned in the above article can be found on the playlist; - <http://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PL...qMWAHpXXtn> ([http://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PLQuAW\\_Ov\\_RlHHY5gAm-9iRqMWAHpXXtn](http://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PLQuAW_Ov_RlHHY5gAm-9iRqMWAHpXXtn))

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157214)**

by **IWannaBeABluesSinger** » Fri Jul 25, 2014 10:13 pm

Your arguments do not comply with copyright law, so I'm not sure what the argument is. The English language versions of the song do not constitute new compositions, anymore than different arrangements constitute new compositions. Even the lyricists have never claimed that their versions were new songs.

The point is that Dusty wanted to do an English version of the song, and she hoped that no one would beat her to it. Someone did, but it wasn't successful. Hers was, and has become the accepted version. Dusty wins.

Maggie

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157215)**

by **viper** » Sat Jul 26, 2014 2:46 am

***IWannaBeABluesSinger wrote:***

Your arguments do not comply with copyright law, .....

***viper wrote:***

I intend to further some of these points leaving copyright issues aside.

I'd maintain my argument holds good. 🍌

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157225)**

by **daydreamer** » Sat Jul 26, 2014 7:49 am

***IWannaBeABluesSinger wrote:***

The point is that Dusty wanted to do an English version of the song, and she hoped that no one would beat her to it. Someone did, but it wasn't successful. Hers was, and has become the accepted version. Dusty wins.

Maggie

Which, many words ago, was the point of my first post and it seems I and many others, knew nothing of it!

Top

### **Re: Who knew? (#p157228)**

by **Clive** » Sat Jul 26, 2014 11:27 am

Have to say I'm astonished, I never knew about this, how strange it has escaped attention all these years. Presumably Dusty was aware of and wasn't happy to record it using the first English lyrics.

Top

Display posts from previous:  Sort by

Post a reply

31 posts • Page **1** of **1**

[Return to You Set My Dreams To Music](#)

Jump to:

### **Who is online**

Users browsing this forum: No registered users and 14 guests

Powered by phpBB® Forum Software © phpBB Group :: Style: L\_Antre