

Let's Talk Dusty!

The Ultimate Forum for Dusty Springfield Fans
<http://www.dustyspringfield.org.uk/forum/>

American Idol YDHTSYLM

<http://www.dustyspringfield.org.uk/forum/viewtopic.php?f=7&t=3906>

American Idol YDHTSYLM

Page 1 of 1

by **st louis blues**

Posted: **Thu May 03, 2012 3:22 am**

During the second hour of AI the theme was Brit Pop. I was surprised that one of the girls performed YDHTSYLM as a country ballad. I was happy that this time Dusty was mentioned. Steven Van Zant, longtime member of Springsteen's band, was a guest mentor. I know he is a big fan of Dusty. I can't remember the source, but I read an article where he said some nice things about her. Tonight he something about her being the queen of the British Invasion and they briefly showed her picture. In addition, Steven Tyler made similiar comments and mentioned how she competed with the Beatles and Stones on the charts. I think they both said something about her being the female Brit who stood along with those bands.

Re: American Idol YDHTSYLM

by **jeffery**

Posted: **Thu May 03, 2012 3:43 am**

👍 Yeh SLB, I heard all about that when I got home, and dropped what I was doing to search for it on youtube.

It's too early for anyone to post it yet, but you can be sure it'll be there. 🙌

Re: American Idol YDHTSYLM

by **daydreamer**

Posted: **Thu May 03, 2012 7:06 am**

Good to know that she got her rightful recognition this time 😊

Re: American Idol YDHTSYLM

by **charlotte**

Posted: **Thu May 03, 2012 1:05 pm**

I was so proud that they did give Dusty her props !! And loved seeing her picture flash across the screen.

Did not enjoy the "country" version of this song. You just don't mess with perfection.

Re: American Idol YDHTSYLM

by **karen**

Posted: **Thu May 03, 2012 1:17 pm**

Skylar Laine ..YDHTSYLM 🤔

Re: American Idol YDHTSYLM

by **jeffery**

Posted: **Thu May 03, 2012 3:23 pm**

charlotte wrote:

I was so proud that they did give Dusty her props !! And loved seeing her picture flash across the screen. Did not enjoy the "country" version of this song. You just don't mess with perfection.

😞 Yeh, I tried to watch the vid, but I'm only getting audio. Just as well - the first bars just kinda dragged it down.

Don't they know you just can't mess with perfection ?

I'll try later, and maybe it'll play out better. 😞

Re: American Idol YDHTSYLM

by **boztiggs**

Posted: **Thu May 03, 2012 5:26 pm**

Well, guess what LOL, I thoroughly enjoyed it!! I think she did a very good job and I liked her voice, and I liked the fact that she`d done a country version, rather than try to tackle it the Dusty way which so many people do and fail miserably at, id vote for her!

Neil 😊

Re: American Idol YDHTSYLM

by **Sweetbaby**

Posted: **Thu May 03, 2012 8:04 pm**

😊 I was also happy to hear Dusty given her due. I like Skylar but didn't feel she & YDHTSYLM did much for each other. Still I'm glad the reaction was positive: I'm not a fan of the twangy country music that's Skylar's mainstay but I love her voice on Southern-fried rock songs like CCR's *Fortunate Son* & she's a dynamic live performer. I don't emotionally invest in American Idol but I'd be happy if Skylar wins.

Re: American Idol YDHTSYLM

by **jeffery**

Posted: **Thu May 03, 2012 10:06 pm**

Sweetbaby wrote:

😊 I was also happy to hear Dusty given her due. I like Skylar but didn't feel she & YDHTSYLM did much for each other. Still I'm glad the reaction was positive: I'm not a fan of the twangy country music that's Skylar's mainstay but I love her voice on Southern-fried rock songs like CCR's *Fortunate Son* & she's a dynamic live performer. I don't emotionally invest in American Idol but I'd be happy if Skylar wins.

🤔 It's still all a rumor to me.
Haven't had a chance to catch up with any of it, but everyone says the same thing . 😊
👂 Skylar is good, and they love her voice.
And all the way down the line, these folks have paid there respect to Dusty. 🙌👏
That's so good to hear ! 🍀

Re: American Idol YDHTSYLM

by **Sweetbaby**

Posted: **Fri May 04, 2012 1:28 am**

🌹 Alas YDHTSYLM proved to be the last song Skylar will ever perform as an AI contestant - she was this week's eliminee.

Re: American Idol YDHTSYLM

by **st louis blues**

Posted: **Fri May 04, 2012 2:00 am**

Well Skyler was in the bottom two along with Holly. Holly performed SOAPM a few weeks ago. I knew one of the girls would get kicked off because for the past several years it has really come down to the cute guys being voted on by I presume young teenage girls. In fact, it has been five years since a girl has won. Anyway, Skyler was asked what she would do if she got to stay on for next week. She replied she would pick a better ballad.

🤔 I think the song got away from her at the end; she tried to attack it and it came out a little rough for me. I agree with Jimmy Iovine when he said it lacked the darkness of Dusty's version. I'm not sure I would have used those exact words, but I understand what he was getting at. At least it brought some awareness to her music. That's always a good thing, but a wish someone would go into some of the album cuts of Dusty. There are so many great songs that could be chosen.

Re: American Idol YDHTSYLM

by **mnmcv1**

Posted: **Fri May 04, 2012 3:23 am**

i watched it with Curt (actually, he was watching it-I was doing things around the house), when they announced someone was doing a Dusty song I thought "it can't be SOAPM, someone already did it this season". YDHTSYLM is the obvious 2nd choice (and it's been done multiple times in prior seasons). I think Curt got more of a kick out of hearing them talk about Dusty than I did! It was nice to see her pic flashed on the screen, and as SLB mentioned, both Stevie Van Zandt and Steven Tyler spoke very well of her.

As for Skylar, I didnt mind the countrified performance.

On Entertainment Weekly's recap (where writer Annie Barrett sometimes freely states if she doesnt care for the song chosen) she wrote of Skylar "...launching into Dusty Springfield's classic "You Don't Have to Say You Love Me." Ugh, this song is so beautiful, do yourself a favor", encouraging people to view a link posted of Dusty performing it on her TV show. 🤔

Re: American Idol YDHTSYLM

by **IWannaBeABluesSinger**

Posted: **Fri May 04, 2012 6:12 am**

It's always a losing proposition for anyone to touch YDHTSYLM - I can't understand why these contestants stack the deck against themselves. Why draw comparisons to someone who is unmatched? Weird strategy.

Maggie

Re: American Idol YDHTSYLM

by **daydreamer**

Posted: **Fri May 04, 2012 6:41 am**

I listened to the audio clip on here and it did nothing at all for me. It needs to be sung as it was written, as a big Italian ballad. Dusty knew what she was doing, there are some songs you just don't mess around with. Skylar hasn't got a bad voice but I think that trying to make this song country is a total no no. It did bring Dusty's name to the fore on the internet though, yesterday on Google alerts, there were 50 or so mentions of Dusty in relation to this and it'll probably be the same today.

Re: American Idol YDHTSYLM

by **Carole R.**

Posted: **Fri May 04, 2012 9:51 am**

In my opinion its such a good song that it can take a 'different' interpretation, so, altho this version lacks the drama it has a certain sweetness about it. 😊 🎵

I think that the girl would have struggled(as most do) with trying for the ballad, so went for the easier option. 🤔

This episode reminds me of Dollys 'I Will Always Love You' in reverse . 😊

Carole R xx

Re: American Idol YDHTSYLM

by **Cas19**

Posted: **Fri May 04, 2012 10:08 am**

Just seen this, I listened to it as I do like Country, and she's got that sort of crack in her voice to sing country, but no please don't mess with a Dusty song.

Casx

Re: American Idol YDHTSYLM

by **trek007**

Posted: **Fri May 04, 2012 11:06 am**

Started okay but she lost it towards the end and tried to do the ballad bit then instead of keeping it "country".

She does have quite a good voice, but her song choice could have been better, as so many folk know the original that comparison are natural...

Re: American Idol YDHTSYLM

by **jeffery**

Posted: **Fri May 04, 2012 4:30 pm**

WannaBeBluesSinger wrote:

It's always a losing proposition for anyone to touch YDHTSYLM - I can't understand why these contestants stack the deck against themselves. Why draw comparisons to someone who is unmatched? Wierd strategy. Maggie

😊 That's pretty much my take on it.

I figure the contestants are making song choices based on what (hits) they think people will be familiar with. 🤔

In Skylar's case I think she should have chosen a song less well known, but with a country toned connection such

as: *Where Is A Woman To Go ?* 🤔

On the other hand I guess it's hard for a young girl to emot a womans song. 🤔

★ *Silver Threads n' Golden Needles*

Is another choice more country (less Italian) than Dusty's huge 🤔 YDHTSYLM.

Another country flavored non-hit from Dusty to choose would be: *Willie n' Laura Mae Jones*.

Not picking on her mind you. I just wish one of us could have been her Dusty advisor. 🤔

Re: American Idol YDHTSYLM

by **Sweetbaby**

Posted: **Fri May 04, 2012 6:34 pm**

😊 Well I despoiled my last post - apologize for saying one highlights with a *right-clicked* mouse....Anyway great as it was to hear Dusty lauded on AI I wish Skylar had given our girl's repertoire a pass. The reason I was rooting for Skylar was because of her first performance on the live shows: a blistering rendition of the Faces' *Stay With Me*, & that's the sort of Britpop I think she should have revisited this week. But Skylar had done *Fortunate Son* in the first part of the show & likely she &/or AI wanted her second song to be a ballad. And I don't know if either Skylar's specific song choice factored that much into her going home this week.

Re: American Idol YDHTSYLM

by **st louis blues**

Posted: **Sat May 05, 2012 4:49 am**

I agree that the arrangement was strange. You know a little country then Broadway/Vegas, etc. I think it could have worked better if done a little more in the Patsy Cline or Brenda Lee style. They sang big ballads with strings but balanced it out with some country touches. This song seems to be a bit unlucky; she is the second performer voted off after performing it. Several years ago a Nadia Turner sang it, I think the clip is still on youtube, and if I remember she was pretty good. I wonder if Mad Men has brought more attention to the song than we thought. I still say Dusty was a master at dynamics and using her vibrato.